

# Tradition & Discovery

## The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXIX

Number 3 (completes Volume XXIX)

2002--2003

---

Preface.....	2
News and Notes .....	3
Information on Electronic Discussion Group.....	3
2003 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting Program.....	4
Regarding Philip Clayton .....	5
Philip Rolnick--Guest Editor	
Philip Clayton--Biographical Sketch.....	7
Emergence, Supervenience, and Personal Knowledge.....8	
Philip Clayton	
On Polanyi, Clayton, and Biology: Some Musings of a Recovering Reductionist.....	20
Martinez Hewlett	
Emergence and Supervenience: A Reply to Philip Clayton.....	23
Gregory R. Peterson	
Submissions for Publication.....	27
God, Contemporary Science and Metaphysics: A Response to Philip D. Clayton....	28
Andy F. Sanders	
Response to Clayton: Taxonomy of the Types and Orders of Emergence.....	32
Walter B. Gulick	
Notes on Contributors.....	47
Emergence — A Response to My Critics.....	48
Philip Clayton	
Information on WWW Polanyi Resources.....	51
Reviews.....	52
Philip Clayton, <i>The Problem of God in Modern Thought</i>	
Reviewed by Curtis L.Thompson	
Polanyi Society Membership.....	55

# The Polanyi Society

## **General Coordinator/Board President**

Walter Gulick  
Montana State University--Billings  
Billings, MT 59101  
(406)657-2904/WGulick@msubillings.edu

## **General Editor-Tradition & Discovery**

Phil Mullins  
Missouri Western State College  
St. Joseph, MO 64507  
(816)271-4386/FAX (816)271-5987/  
mullins@mwc.edu

## **Associate Editor**

Paul Lewis  
Mercer University  
Macon, GA 31207.  
(478)301-4166  
lewis\_pa@mercer.edu

## **Book Review Editor**

Walter Gulick  
Montana State University--Billings  
Billings, MT 59101  
(406)657-2904/WGulick@msubillings.edu

## **Board Treasurer**

Richard Gelwick  
12 Prosser Rd.  
Harpeswell, ME 04079  
(207)725-7975/rprogel@juno.com

## **Annual Meeting Chair/Board Secretary**

Martin X. Moleski, S.J.  
Canisius College  
Buffalo, NY 14208  
(716)888-2383/FAX (716)886-6506  
moleski@canisius.edu

## **Board of Directors**

David Rutledge  
Department of Religion  
Furman University  
Greenville, SC 29613  
David.Rutledge@furman.edu

## **Board of Directors**

John Apczynski  
Box 12/Saint Bonaventure University  
St. Bonaventure, NY 14778  
apczynski@sbu.edu

## **Representatives At Large**

John C. Puddefoot  
Wall House/Slough Road  
Eton/Windsor  
Berks. SL4 6HD UK  
j.puddefoot@etoncollege.org.uk

Andy Sanders  
Faculty of Theology  
Nw. Kijk in 't Jatstraat 104  
9712 St. Groningen / Netherlands  
a.f.sanders@theol.rug.nl

## Preface

This is the last number of Volume XXIX of *TAD*. The Polanyi Society has been publishing material for thirty years. The first publication issued in the fall of 1972 was called a "Quarterly Bulletin" and was titled "Society of Explorers." It had six pages and included a membership list of 35 with some annotations giving members' interests; some of these folks are still members of the Polanyi Society. Also the Bulletin included a short list of recent publications identified as "based on Polanyi's thought," and a feedback sheet asking for input about how future issues of the Bulletin should be shaped. In this first Bulletin, the principal purpose of the Polanyi Society was identified as "to provide interested persons with a communications network by which they can communicate with each other, and the group as a whole, regarding their work and interest in the thought of Michael Polanyi." Although some things have remained the same since the publication of the first Bulletin, many things have changed. We now, for example, have special issues of *TAD* such as this one focused on the work of Philip Clayton and its connection with the thought of Polanyi. If I have remembered them all, this is the sixth special issue in the last decade and others are in the offing. Phil Rolnick worked diligently to put together the 2001 annual meeting session with Philip Clayton, co-sponsored by the Science and Religion Group of the AAR. We had the largest number of folks at this session in years. Rolnick also did yeoman's service in putting together this collection of material growing out of the session. Take a close look at his introduction and then enjoy the essays by Clayton, Hewlett, Peterson, Sanders, and Gulick as well as Thompson's careful review of a recent Clayton book. This is rich fare and Phil Clayton is due thanks for his interest in this Polanyi Society project and his generous and cooperative spirit.

Please also note on page 5 that the plans are already in place for an interesting annual meeting in Atlanta this November.

Phil Mullins

*Tradition and Discovery* is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher's Index* and *Religion One: Periodicals*. Book reviews are indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*.

---

## NEWS AND NOTES

---

On March 6, 2003, **Paul Knepper** (knepper@mail.ecu.edu) gave a guest lecture, titled “Michael Polanyi and the Prospect of Post-Critical Criminology,” to students at Tel Aviv University in the Faculty of Law. The presentation critiqued the epistemologies of Karl Popper and Michel Foucault (two prevailing perspectives in social-scientific criminology these days), and went on to sketch Polanyi’s theory of personal knowledge and its implications for the study of crime. Knepper is Professor and Associate Dean in the College of Human Ecology, East Carolina University, Greenville, North Carolina, and is co-editor of *Israel Studies in Criminology*; he invites Polanyi fans to take a look at a recent call for papers for this journal which publishes social science, but also moral theory, historical and legal studies

**Mary Jo Nye** (nyem@ucs.orst.edu) is a historian of chemistry interested in Polanyi; she recently published a brief biographical statement (focusing on his contributions to chemistry) on Polanyi in *HYLE: International Journal For Philosophy of Chemistry*, 8 (Fall 2002), 123-127. This is also available online at [http://www.hyle.org/journal/issues/8-2/bio\\_nye.html](http://www.hyle.org/journal/issues/8-2/bio_nye.html) Some of Nye’s scholarship treating Polanyi have been listed before in News and Notes, but the following are other recent essays:

“Laboratory Practice and the Physical Chemistry of Michael Polanyi,” pp. 367-400 in *Instruments and Experimentation in the History of Chemistry*, ed. F. L. Holmes and Trevor Levere (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 2000).

“At the Boundaries: Michael Polanyi’s Work on Surfaces and the Solid State,” pp. 246-257 in *Chemical Sciences in the Twentieth Century*, ed. Carsten Reinhardt (Berlin: Wiley-VCH, 2001).

“Michael Polanyi’s Theory of Surface Adsorption: How Premature?” pp.151-163 in *Prematurity and Scientific Discovery*, ed. Ernest B. Hook (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).

Two recent books on Polanyi’s thought are **Stefania Ruzsits Jha’s** *Reconsidering Michael Polanyi’s Philosophy* (University of Pittsburg Press, 2002) and **Esther Lightcap Meek’s** *Longing to Know: The Philosophy of Knowledge for Ordinary People* (Brazos Press, due out in July of 2003). We hope to review both books in a future issue of *TAD*.

**Phil Mullins’** essay, “Peirce’s Abduction and Polanyi’s Tacit Knowing,” appeared in a recent issue of *Journal of Speculative Philosophy* (Vol. 16, No. 3, 2002: 198-224).

### Electronic Discussion List

The Polanyi Society supports an electronic discussion group exploring implications of the thought of Michael Polanyi. Anyone interested can send e-mail to Struan Jacobs (swjacobs@deakin.edu.au) who is the moderator. The address for the list is polanyi-list@deakin.edu.au

# 2003 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting in Atlanta

The year's Polanyi Society annual meeting will be held in Atlanta, Georgia on November 21 and 22, 2003. As in past years, meetings are to be held in conjunction with the annual meeting of the American Academy of Religion and Society for Biblical Literature. To secure hotel reservations in the immediate convention area, it is necessary to register for the AAR/SBL annual meeting. However, anyone who is interested is welcome to attend the Polanyi Society meetings, whether or not they are attending the AAR/SBL meetings. Other hotels in Atlanta are not reserved for the AAR/SBL. If you want information about registration for the AAR/SBL meetings, go to <http://www.aarweb.org/default.asp> or phone (1-800-575-7185 or +1-330-425-9330 [outside US and Canada]) or email [aarsblreg@reg@conferon.com](mailto:aarsblreg@reg@conferon.com). Room locations for the annual meeting sessions are not yet available but will, in the summer, be posted on the Polanyi Society web site (<http://www.mwsc.edu/orgs/polanyi/>) and will be listed in the AAR/SBL Annual Meeting Program as Additional Meetings. Additional information will be included in the issue of *TAD* to be published in the fall of 2003. When the complete papers are available in the fall, they can be downloaded from the Polanyi Society web site by clicking on the title.

## Program

*Friday, November 21, 9:00 p.m. - 11:00 p.m.*

Theme: Michael Polanyi's Understanding of Teleology"

Moderator: Paul Lewis, Mercer University

"Polanyi's Daring Epistemology and the Hunger for Teleology"

Richard Gelwick, University of New England

"The Discovery of Meaning through Scientific and Religious Forms of Indwelling"

John Apczynski, St. Bonaventure

Respondent: Walt Gulick, Montana State University-Billings

Open Discussion

*Saturday, November 22, 9 AM. - 11:30 a.m.*

Theme: "Science, Religion and Reality"

Moderator: Phil Mullins, Missouri Western State College

"Polanyi on Religion"

Tony Clark, University of St. Andrews

"The Tacit and the Unknowable: The Bearing of Each Upon Faith and Knowing"

Walter Mead, Illinois State University.

"Polanyi's Epistemology of Discovery as Applied to Science, Religion, and Astrology"

Aaron Milavec, University of Victoria

Open Discussion

Business Meeting (11:15)-Marty Moleski, Presiding

For additional information contact Marty Moleski, Religious Studies, Canisius College, Buffalo, NY 14208. Tel.: (716) 888-2383 FAX: (716) 886-6506 Email: [moleski@canisius.edu](mailto:moleski@canisius.edu)