

Tradition & Discovery

The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXXVIII

Number 3
(Completes Volume XXXVIII)

2011--2012

Preface.....	2
News and Notes.....	3
Submissions for Publication.....	4
Letter to the Editor.....	5
2012 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting Program.....	6

Michael Polanyi and Charles Sanders Peirce

“Polanyi and Peirce: An Introduction and an Historiographical Note”.....	7
Phil Mullins	
Electronic Discussion List and WWW Polanyi Resources.....	12
“Polanyi and Peirce on the Critical Method”.....	13
David W. Agler	
Notes on Contributors.....	30
“The Reach of the Aesthetic and Religious Naturalism: Peircean and Polanyian Reflections”.....	31
Robert E. Innis	
“Intellectual Passions, Heuristic Virtues, and Shared Practices: Charles Peirce and Michael Polanyi on Experimental Inquiry”.....	51
Vincent Colapietro	
Reviews.....	67
Esther Lightcap Meek, <i>Loving to Know: Introducing Covenant Epistemology</i>	
Andrew Grosso	
Robert B. Brandom, <i>Perspectives on Pragmatism: Classical, Recent, and Contemporary</i>	
David W. Agler	
Clark Moustakas, <i>Heuristic Research: Design, Methodology, and Applications.</i>	
Robert P. Hyatt	
Terrence W. Deacon, <i>Incomplete Nature: How Mind Emerged from Matter</i>	
Donald A. Crosby	
Thomas Jay Oord (ed.). <i>The Polkinghorne Reader: Science, Faith and the Search for Meaning</i>	
Richard Gelwick	

The Polanyi Society

General Editor-Tradition & Discovery
Phil Mullins
Missouri Western State University
St. Joseph, MO 64507
(816)244-2612 FAX (816)271-5987
mullins@missouriwestern.edu

David Rutledge, **Board President**
Department of Religion
Furman University
Greenville, SC 29613-6298
David.Rutledge@furman.edu

Diane Yeager, **Board Vice President**
Theology Department
Georgetown University
37th and O Streets, NW
Washington, DC 20057
yeagerd@georgetown.edu

Dale Cannon, **Board Secretary**
Division of Humanities
Western Oregon University
Monmouth, OR 97361 USA
cannodw@wou.edu

Charles Lowney, **Board Treasurer**
Department of Philosophy
Washington and Lee University
Lexington, VA 24450
lowneyc@wlu.edu

Gus Breyspraak
Ottawa University
4370 W. 109th Street Suite 200
Overland Park, KS 66211
gus.breyspraak@ottawa.edu

Andrew Grosso
Trinity Episcopal Church
300 S Fifth St.
Atchison, KS 66002
rector@trinityks.org

Walter Mead
4 Kenyon Court
Bloomington, IL 61701-3320
wmead@ilstu.edu

Esther Meek
Geneva College
Beaver Falls, PA 15010
longingtoknow@gmail.com

Phil Rolnick
University of St. Thomas
2115 Summit Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55105
parolnick@stthomas.edu

Zhenhua Yu
Department of Philosophy
East China Normal University
3663 North Zhongshan Rd.
Shanghai 200062, China
ecnyu@hotmail.com

Tony Clark
Department of Religion and Humanities
Friends University
2100 W. University St.
Wichita, KS 67213
clarkto@friends.edu

Associate Editor
Paul Lewis
Mercer University
Macon, GA 31207
(478) 301-4166
lewis_pa@mercer.edu

Book Review Editor
Walter Gulick
Montana State University--Billings
Billings, MT 59101
(406) 259-3622
WGulick@msubillings.edu

Preface

This issue is being put together at the same time that Marty Moleski, S.J. and I are making the final preparations for the June 8-10 Loyola Conference. There is a paragraph about the conference in “News and Notes.” In a word, this conference looks much like the 2001 and 2008 Loyola conferences—it promises two and a half days of stimulating interaction for the projected 45 people interested in Michael Polanyi’s thought who are attending. Undoubtedly, some of the papers and presentations from the conference will eventually find their way into *TAD*. The conference program, which includes abstracts, will, until the fall, be available on the Polanyi Society web site (polanysisociety.org).

Also in “News and Notes” are several bibliographic items and following this section there is an interesting Letter to the Editor (p. 5) prompted by last issue’s discussion of Mary Jo Nye’s book, *Michael Polanyi and His Generation, Origins of the Social Construction of Science*, a book that is now being widely reviewed. The writer, Paul Craig Roberts, was perhaps Polanyi’s last graduate student and has written about Polanyi’s views on economics.

The fall 2012 annual meeting program (November 17, 2012 in Chicago) of the Polanyi Society is in this issue. There are papers by Andrew Grosso and David Stone. François Euvé, S.J., Professor of Theology, Center Sèvres (Paris), a physicist and theologian, who is visiting at Georgetown University, will provide another presentation. Finally, Dale Cannon’s paper, with Jake Sherman as respondent, will apply ideas discussed in last year’s treatment of Polanyi and the “Participatory Turn” to specific issues of religious practice (Sherman provided the paper in 2011 and Cannon responded). In sum, the fall annual meeting should be very interesting.

This issue is a special topical issue focused on intersections in the thought of Polanyi and Charles Sanders Peirce. Since I provide a short introduction to the issue, I won’t say more here other than that I am pleased to have pulled together extraordinarily thoughtful essays by David Agler, Robert Innis and Vincent Colapietro, three first-rate scholars. Finally, there are more reviews than normal in this issue of *TAD*, five, and all treat books likely of interest to those to whom Polanyi’s ideas are important.

Phil Mullins

Tradition & Discovery is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher’s Index* and *Religious and Theological Abstracts* and is included in the EBSCO online database of academic and research journals.

NEWS AND NOTES

A Note on Dues Payment

The Oct. and Feb. but not the July issue of *TAD* include a membership flyer and an addressed envelope to be used to mail annual academic year dues and/or to make donations to the Polanyi Society. US postage regulations require that **EVERY** copy of *TAD* mailed in the postage class used must weigh exactly the same. Thus, even if you pay your annual dues in October, you will, nevertheless, receive these membership materials in your February copy of *TAD*. Dues remain \$35 (\$25 for libraries and \$15 students), a bargain in the academic journal world. Except for those residing outside the US, members should pay dues with a check. **The Society can no longer easily and inexpensively process credit cards.** There is a Pay Pal payment option on the Polanyi Society web page. But since Pay Pal charges the Society for its services, if you can write a check in dollars, this is preferred. Note that dues and donations are handled by the Polanyi Society Treasurer, Charles Lowney, whose address is on page 2 of *TAD* as well as on payment envelopes normally included with the October and February issues. Phil Mullins should be contacted directly for *TAD* address changes (contact information is also on page 2 of *TAD*).

Travel Assistance Available For Younger Scholars Attending Polanyi Society Meetings

For students and other young scholars planning to attend the November 2012 Annual Meeting in Chicago, limited travel funding is available. Society members are urged to inform worthy candidates about this assistance. Those interested in this funding, as well as those who know of potential candidates, should contact Walter Mead (wbmead@ilstu.edu). Contributions to the travel fund are always welcome; those interested in contributing should e-mail Walter Mead. Related information about travel funds can also be found on the Polanyi Society web site (polanyisociety.org).

Polanyi Society Speakers Bureau

The Polanyi Society's Speakers Bureau helps organize talks to groups by Polanyi scholars. Marty Moleski, S. J. and Richard Gelwick gave talks in 2010 at universities; Richard Moodey and Phil Mullins gave talks in summer of 2011 at a meeting in Gummersbach, Germany. If you know anyone who might be interested in a speaker, send the name and e-mail address to Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu). There is now a link on the Polanyi Society web page with general information about the Speakers Bureau. You will find there a précis of the talks given by Moleski and Gelwick. Several Society members have indicated interest in speaking on different aspects of Polanyi's thought. It is likely that the Society can arrange for someone nearby to provide a talk on a topic of interest.

June 2012 Loyola Conference

The Polanyi Society-sponsored conference ("Connections/Disconnections: Polanyi and Contemporary Concerns and Domains of Inquiry") advertised in recent issues of *TAD* takes place June 8-1, 2011, at the Water Tower campus of Loyola University, Chicago. At the time this issue of *TAD* went to press in mid May, all indications are that this Loyola conference, like those in 2001 and 2008, will be an interesting event involving about 45 people from the United States as well as Israel, Portugal, Hungary, Poland, the Netherlands and Australia. There will be 24 individual papers presented and two panel discussions, each with 4 discussants. One panel discussion will focus on Polanyi and politics/political philosophy and the other on Polanyi and mysticism. In addition to the opening plenary talk on June 8 at 8 p.m. by Mary Jo Nye and the June 9 evening banquet plenary by Walter Gulick, there will be a plenary session showing of Polanyi's 1940 film *Unemployment and Money* (with a discussion following). If you are interested in additional information about the conference, the schedule as well as abstracts of papers and panel presentations will be

on the Polanyi Society web site (polanysociety.org) during the summer.

Carlo Vinti (University of Perugia) published in February, 2012 an Italian collection of Polanyi essays titled *Fede e ragione* (faith and reason). In addition to the ten essays, Vinti provides a 51 page introduction, “Fede E Ragione Nella Riflessione Epistemologica Di Michael Polanyi (faith and reason in the epistemological reflection of Michael Polanyi). For more information, go to the publisher’s web site (www.morcelliana.com).

Philip A. Rolnick and (molecular biologist) **Jayna L. Ditty** published “Keeping Faith: Evolution and Theology” in *Logos* 13:2 (Winter, 2010): 132-152.

Philip A. Rolnick published “Persons at Home in the Universe: Openness, Purpose, and Transcendence” in *In Search of Self: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Personhood* (J. Wentzel van Huyssteen and Erik Wiebe, eds. [Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2011], 357-374).

Paul Lewis has had an article published in the UK-based *Journal of Moral Education*. “In Defense of Aristotle on Character: Toward a Synthesis of Recent Psychology, Neuroscience, and the Thought of Michael Polanyi” has already appeared in electronic form and will appear in the next print edition of the journal.

Eduardo Beira, a professor in the School of Engineering, University of Minho and EDAM Professor of MIT Portugal Program, is in the middle of a large project which translates into Portuguese (and publishes in small academic editions) a number of works by Michael Polanyi. The translations of *The Study of Man* and *The Tacit Dimension* were released early in 2012. Later in the year, there will be *The Contempt of Freedom* and *Full Employment and Free Trade* and then *Science and Technology* (a collection of Polanyi essays about science and technology) and *Discovery and Knowing* (a collection of essays about tacit knowing and the discovery process). Beira has also done a citation analysis of Polanyi’s writings which was intended to evaluate how well a Polanyi bibliography

can be reconstructed from Web of Science and Google Scholar. The analysis shows an interesting increase over time of the influence of Polanyi’s writings. Beira recently digitized Polanyi’s 1940 economics film titled *Unemployment and Money* and he kindly offered to bring this little-known film to the upcoming Loyola conference; a showing and discussion is scheduled for June 9, 2012.

Submissions for Publication

Articles, meeting notices and notes likely to be of interest to persons interested in the thought of Michael Polanyi are welcomed. Review suggestions and book reviews should be sent to Walter Gulick (see addresses listed below). Manuscripts, notices and notes should be sent to Phil Mullins. Manuscripts should be double-spaced type with notes at the end; writers are encouraged to employ simple citations within the text when possible. MLA or APA style is preferred. Because the journal serves English writers across the world, we do not require anybody’s “standard English.” Abbreviate frequently cited book titles, particularly books by Polanyi (e.g., *Personal Knowledge* becomes PK). Shorter articles (10-15 pages) are preferred, although longer manuscripts (20-24 pages) will be considered. Consistency and clear writing are expected. Manuscripts normally will be sent out for blind review. Authors are expected to provide an electronic copy as an e-mail attachment.

Phil Mullins
MWSU
St. Joseph, MO 64507
Ph: (816) 244-2612 Fax (816) 271-5680
mullins@missouriwestern.edu

Walter Gulick
MSU, Billings
Billings, MT 59101
Ph: (406) 259-3622 Fax (406) 657-2187
WGulick@msubillings.edu

Letter to the Editor

Dear Editor,

I am a bit too rusty on Polanyi's writing to participate in debates and have not followed the discussions over the past 30 years. However, having spent so much time with Polanyi, I do sense from time to time certain misinterpretations of Polanyi.

Many come at Polanyi from the standpoint of their own discipline. For example, something strikes me as not quite right about the Mary Jo Nye discussion in the 38: 2 issue of *TAD*. Michael did not set out to fashion a social epistemology of science. Michael set out to save Western civilization from dangerous inconsistencies in its intellectual foundations. To understand his motives, one must understand his essays, "Beyond Nihilism," "On the Modern Mind," and "Why Did We Destroy Europe." Michael believed that Western civilization was in danger of destroying itself because an incorrect understanding of science prevented legitimate expression of moral motives. Unable to speak in their own terms, moral motives became inverted and erupted in the French and the Bolshevik revolutions.

Michael's opposition to planned science and planned economy were responses to claims, such as those expressed to him by Bukharin in Moscow in 1935. Michael understood that the creative act of discovery could not be planned. He concluded that planning science would destroy it.

Unlike almost everyone else, Michael understood that communists meant by economic planning the replacement of "commodity production," that is a market economy, with an economy organized like a medieval manor in which output was organized for direct use and there was no "products exchange" or buying and selling in markets. He understood that this was an impossibility for a modern industrial economy in which there are many combinations of inputs and outputs and rapidly emerging technological discoveries. He concluded that such an effort at economic planning would completely disorganize the economy, which is exactly what happened when Lenin tried it during the "war communism" period.

What I mean to say is that Michael's motives were not the normal professional academic motives to create a new theory or a new explanation, but to save Western civilization from threats emanating from intellectual failures at the core of its thought. He set out to save us from these failures by providing a more truthful understanding of knowing and being. He did not leave science because he became more interested in theories of social science and philosophy. His mission was different from that of academics and scholars. His contributions were the product of his pursuit of his mission.

Paul Craig Roberts

Editor's note: Roberts, one of Polanyi's last graduate students, had careers as a scholar, public policy maker, and journalist. He had several academic appointments, including Senior Research Fellow, Hoover Institution, Stanford University, and William E. Simon Chair in Political Economy, Center for Strategic and International Studies, Georgetown University. He was Associate Editor and columnist for the *Wall Street Journal* and *Business Week's* first outside columnist. He served in the Congressional staff and as Assistant Secretary of the Treasury in the Reagan administration. His essays in *TAD* 25:3 and 32:3 are in the online *TAD* archives.

2012 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting Program

The annual meeting for the Polanyi Society for 2012 is projected to be November 17, 2012 in Chicago in conjunction with the American Academy of Religion annual meeting. There will be a morning and evening session with two papers apiece. Additional information about locations will be posted on the Polanyi Society web site (polanysisociety.org) when it is available in the summer or early fall.. The papers will also be posted on the web site by early November.

Session I : Saturday morning, Nov. 17th, 9 – 11:30 a.m.

9:00

Andrew Grosso, Trinity Episcopal Church, Atchison, KS

“Michael Polanyi Meets Abba Moses: Embodiment, Indwelling, and Interdisciplinarity”

10:00-10:15 Break

10:15

David Stone, Northern Illinois University

“Realigning the Tacit and Indwelling”

11:15 - Business Meeting

Session II: Saturday evening, Nov. 17th, 7 – 9:30 p.m.

7:00 p.m.

François Euvé, S.J., Professor of Theology, Center Sèvres (Paris)

“Polanyi and the Renewed Dialogue between Religion and the Natural Sciences” [tentative]

8:00-8:15 Break

8:15 p.m.

Dale Cannon, Western Oregon University

“A Polanyian-Participatory Approach to Comparative Study of Religion: *The Questions of King Melinda* and Anselm’s *Proslogion* as Two Traditions of Religious Practice”

Response: Jake Sherman, California Institute of Integral Studies