

Tradition & Discovery

The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXXVII

Number 2

2010--2011

Preface.....	2
News and Notes.....	3
2012 Polanyi Society Conference--First Announcement.....	7
“Connections/Disconnections: Polanyi and Contemporary Concerns and Domains of Inquiry”	
2011 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting--Call for Papers	8
The Crucial Concept of Embodiment: David Nikkel’s Account.....	9
David Rutledge	
WWW Polanyi Resources.....	15
A Response to David Rutledge.....	16
David Nikkel	
Marjorie Grene and <i>Personal Knowledge</i>	20
Phil Mullins	
That “Treacherous Footnote”: Assessing Grene’s Critique of Polanyi.....	45
Walter Gulick	
Submissions for Publication.....	57
Reviews	58
Alva Noë, <i>Action in Perception</i>	
Alva Noë, <i>Out of Our Heads: Why You Are Not Your Brain, and Other Lessons from the Biology of Consciousness</i>	
Dale Cannon	
Marjorie Grene and David Depew, <i>The Philosophy of Biology: An Episodic History</i>	
James M. Okapal	
Notes on Contributors.....	63

The Polanyi Society

General Editor-Tradition & Discovery

Phil Mullins
Missouri Western State University
St. Joseph, MO 64507
(816)244-2612 FAX (816)271-5987
mullins@missouriwestern.edu

David Rutledge, Board President

Department of Religion
Furman University
Greenville, SC 29613-6298
David.Rutledge@furman.edu

Diane Yeager, Board Vice President

Theology Department
Georgetown University
37th and O Streets, NW
Washington, DC 20057
yeagerd@georgetown.edu

Dale Cannon, Board Secretary

Division of Humanities
Western Oregon University
Monmouth, OR 97361 USA
cannodw@wou.edu

Charles Lowney, Board Treasurer

Department of Philosophy
Washington and Lee University
Lexington, VA 24450
lowneyc@wlu.edu

Gus Breytspraak

Ottawa University
4370 W. 109th Street Suite 200
Overland Park, KS 66211
gus.breytspraak@ottawa.edu

Andrew Grosso

Trinity Episcopal Church
300 S Fifth St.
Atchison, KS 66002
rector@trinityks.org

Walter Mead

4 Kenyon Court
Bloomington, IL 61701-3320
wbmead@comcast.net

Esther Meek

Geneva College
Beaver Falls, PA 15010
longingtoknow@gmail.com

Phil Rolnick

University of St. Thomas
2115 Summit Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55105
parolnick@stthomas.edu

Zhenhua Yu

Department of Philosophy
East China Normal University
3663 North Zhongshan Rd.
Shanghai 200062, China
ecnuyy@hotmail.com

Tony Clark

Department of Religion and Humanities
Friends University
2100 W. University St.
Wichita, KS 67213
clarkto@friends.edu

Associate Editor

Paul Lewis
Mercer University
Macon, GA 31207
(478) 301-4166
lewis_pa@mercer.edu

Book Review Editor

Walter Gulick
Montana State University--Billings
Billings, MT 59101
(406) 259-3622
WGulick@msubillings.edu

Preface

TAD 37:2 is the issue following the Society's annual meeting in Atlanta so you will find several important business matters in News and Notes and succeeding pages. The Minutes of the meeting are included as well as the Treasurer's Report. Note in the Minutes that the Society has established an endowment program about which more will be said in the future. Establishing an endowment is an effort taken by the Board to provide more long-term financial stability for the Polanyi Society, allowing us more predictably to support projects such as travel for graduate student to the recent Atlanta meeting featuring graduate student papers. Please also notice that this issue includes a self-addressed envelope for academic year 2010-2011 dues payment. Anyone still puzzled about why the first two issues of each year include envelopes should see the note on the opposite page about mailing regulations. On page 7 of this issue, you will find the first announcement concerning a June 2012 Polanyi Society conference, "Connections/Disconnections: Polanyi and Contemporary Concerns and Domains of Inquiry." This event will likely be held at Loyola University, Chicago and will be organized in a way similar to the 2008 conference at Loyola. Hopefully, proposals for presentations at this conference will begin to come in this spring. Also, on page 8, there is an announcement and call for papers for the fall 2011 annual meeting of the Society in San Francisco.

David Nikkel has written a provocative new book, *Radical Embodiment*, that David Rutledge covers in his review article; there follows a response from Nikkel. There are two articles on Marjorie Grene here. My essay traces Grene's changing response to *Personal Knowledge* and Polanyi's ideas as well as Harry Prosch's criticisms of Grene. Walter Gulick's essay is a clear and balanced response to the several criticisms of Polanyi that Grene made over the course of her long life. Finally, there is Dale Cannon's review of two books by David Noe, an interesting philosopher of mind, plus James Okapal's review of Marjorie Grene and David Depew *The Philosophy of Biology: An Episodic History*.

Phil Mullins

Tradition & Discovery is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher's Index* and *Religious and Theological Abstracts* and is included in the EBSCO online database of academic and research journals.

NEWS AND NOTES

A Note on Dues Payment

Please notice that this issue of *TAD* includes a self-addressed return envelope to be used to pay 2010-2011 academic year membership dues. The Polanyi Society is a registered non-profit organization that operates on a fiscal cycle that roughly coincides with the academic year so dues are collected each fall. The October and February issues of *TAD* normally include a self-addressed return envelope. US postage regulations, require that EVERY copy of *TAD* mailed in the postage class used must weigh exactly the same. Thus, even if you promptly paid your dues with the October issue's return envelope, this *TAD* will also include an envelope. If you cannot recall if you have already paid for 2010-2011, e-mail an inquiry to Phil Mullins. Dues remain \$35 (\$25 for libraries and \$15 students), a bargain in the academic journal world. You can (1) send credit card information and authorization to debit from your account the amount of your dues (mullins@missouriwestern.edu or fax 816-271-5680) or (2) send a check to Phil Mullins (HPG, MWSU, St. Joseph, MO 64507 USA). Sorry but we cannot handle American Express cards.

Polanyi Society Speakers Bureau

The Polanyi Society's Speakers Bureau is available to anyone interested. Marty Moleski, S. J. and Richard Gelwick gave talks in 2010 at Loyola University of Maryland and Yale University respectively. If you know anyone who might be interested in sponsoring a talk, send the name and e-mail address to Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu). There is now a link on the Polanyi Society web page with general information about the Speakers Bureau. You will find there a precis of the talks given last spring by Moleski and Gelwick.

Minutes of the October 31, 2010 Meeting of the Polanyi Society Board of Directors

Present: Voting members: Paul Lewis, Charles Lowney, Dale Cannon, Jere Moorman, David Rutledge, Phil Rolnick, Wally Mead and Esther Meek (arrived late). Non-voting members Walt Gulick, Phil Mullins, Andrew Grosso and Gus Breyspraak. Guests: Mary Speckhard (student of Esther Meek).

1. President David Rutledge called the meeting to order at Mary Mac's Restaurant in Atlanta at approximately 8:25 PM.
2. The Minutes from the Board meeting in Montreal of November 6, 2009, were approved.
3. Jere Moorman, Treasurer, gave the Annual Treasurer's Report. He first covered the Scott Fund, which recently closed out a CD at \$8167.66. Phil visited with Ann Scott in the summer of 2010 and discussed with her plans for setting up an endowment account. David and Phil will write Ann Scott a letter following establishment of this account, explaining its operational procedures and our plans to add her donation to the endowment. There should be opportunity to honor Bill Scott and support scholarship on Polanyi in projects that the new Endowment Committee proposes. Jere went quickly over the rest of the Treasurer's Report. Currently there is a balance of \$4641.52. The Report was approved.
4. Walt Gulick gave the Nominating Committee Report (Committee Members: Phil Mullins, Wally Mead, and Walt Gulick): Two people are "term limited" and will need to move off of Board membership: Jere Moorman and Paul Lewis. This will necessitate election of a new Treasurer. Two people have been nominated to the Board and have accepted: Gus Breyspraak and Andrew Grosso. David Rutledge has agreed to

serve a second 3-year term. Charles Lowney has been nominated to become Treasurer and has accepted. Diane Yeager has been nominated to become Vice President (to replace Paul Lewis) and has accepted. These nominations were formally approved.

5. Phil Mullins presented the *TAD* Report.

6. Wally Mead presented the Travel Fund Report. This year we assisted attendance for 8 new young scholars, with an average subsidy of \$300.00. Jere moved that \$500 from the General Fund be transferred to the Travel Fund to replenish the account. The Board approved the motion. In the future, Travel Fund money will still need to go to Wally (who for the time being will remain in charge of the Travel Fund) but via the Treasurer.

7. Phil Mullins presented the Speakers Bureau Report. He identified a few possibilities that will be explored further at Duke University and the GTU. Jere would like to see us get better at public relations, say about what we are doing this weekend to enlist a new generation of scholars. He requested permission to pursue this possibility. This generated some discussion, even as to whether a Speakers Bureau was necessary. A couple of Board members said that personal contact is the most effective way to set up a presentation. Jere suggested that we invite members of the Society to be speakers. Someone else suggested that the web page advertising the Speakers Bureau be filled out with topical areas. The suggestion was made to continue the discussion online on our Board email list.

8. Paul Lewis presented the Meeting Report (the *ad hoc* Program Committee included Phil Mullins, Walt Gulick, David Rutledge, and Paul Lewis). Phil Rolnick and Neil Arner organized this year's meeting. Our schedule in past years was changed in order to separate the first presentations from the Board Meeting (all in one evening was too much for many folks). Paul requested feedback on this year's schedule. Next year the SBL will be back with the AAR in San Francisco. We will need to decide about schedule by March or April. Paul expressed gratitude and pleasure at the quality of papers that were submitted this year. 8 proposals

were submitted; 6 were chosen. The younger scholars making presentations on Saturday can submit a longer version to be peer reviewed for publication in *TAD*. David explained that the young scholars present will be taken to lunch tomorrow, with Board Members hosting. Next year one of the sessions will feature Darcia Narvaez of Notre Dame in Psychology. We promised some help with her travel costs. We will try to coordinate with the Religion and Psychology AAR Group. Phil Rolnick suggested that we try to have the session be in their slot, if they are willing. If anyone has further comments, send them to Paul. The question was raised: Do we want to create a formal (and not just *ad hoc*) Program Committee?

9. David Rutledge gave a Fund Raising Report. He mentioned several exploratory forays with no practical result yet. Wally suggested that it was more likely that a donor would give money for a unique experience, such as a conference, than to ongoing activities. Wally said that he and Mark Mitchell met with representatives of The Liberty Fund. It is possible that we could get them interested if we could tie our interests into their conservative intent. Someone suggested that we approach the Templeton Foundation. Walt suggested that personal contacts seem to be more important to explore than general fund raising efforts. Esther said maybe we are going about it in the wrong direction; maybe we should offer mentor services to bring scholars to us. Someone suggested we pursue funding for a Polanyi Studies Center and/or offer seminars on Polanyi. Phil Mullins mentioned Diane Yeager's recommendation that we apply for an NEH Program (Polanyi would likely need to be a focus along with other figures). This is something that she successfully organized in the past.

10. Publications: Walt reported on the state of the Polanyi reader: *Michael Polanyi, Recovering Truths: A Comprehensive Anthology*. He has investigated several publishers. He tried the reader out in a course he taught last year in Estonia, receiving praise from the students. One editor seems currently excited about it, Rowman and Littlefield. Walt is optimistic about the prospects. Wally next brought up an agreement with

the *Bulletin of Science, Technology, and Society* (published in Toronto), edited by Bill Vanderburg, to bring out an issue devoted to Polanyi's thought, like we did with the *Political Science Reviewer*. 11 persons have volunteered to write an article for what is anticipated to be a "thick volume." The expected publication date is Spring 2012. This will be a "new" audience for Polanyi. Wally also reported a conversation with the University of Chicago Press telling him that so far they have sold 2673 copies of *The Tacit Dimension*. The editor also mentioned that John Polanyi gave permission for Penguin Books to publish *The Tacit Dimension* in India.

11. Wally reported on the growing Poteat Archives at Yale Divinity School. David expressed thanks on behalf of the Board to Wally and suggested that we might have a meeting in New Haven to celebrate the opening of the Poteat Archives.

At this point (10:05 pm) we recessed, as the restaurant was closing, and decided to continue the Board Meeting at the Hyatt, once we found an appropriate space.

12. Reconvening at 10:40 pm, Wally presented the proposed change to our Bylaw for the purpose of creating the framework for an Endowment Fund to handle larger contributions (should the Polanyi Society be so fortunate). Phil Mullins' lawyer friend, who for many years has given pro bono legal advice to the Polanyi Society, gave some expert advice in drafting the proposal, which had been circulated in advance. There was considerable discussion around whether we should add a clause to ask a fiscal management firm to oversee endowment funds. Phil Mullins said his lawyer friend had not indicated a further explicit clause beyond what was in the proposed Bylaw changes was necessary in order to hire a professional manager; the lawyer also specifically recommended that the Board, until the endowment had a significant number of dollars, should not seek professional management. Phil brought out that the constitution of the Endowment Committee, according to the proposal, is such that someone from a management firm could be made a member of the Committee without her or him being a

member of the Board. A call for the vote was made, and it was approved as proposed by voice vote. Phil Mullins' lawyer-friend will be re-consulted about the proposed additional clause. If further revision is necessary, it can be done next year.

13. A Possible Polanyi Conference in 2012: One possibility is to return to Loyola University. The price, accommodations, proximity to the Polanyi Paper Archives, and our having experienced two successful conferences there count in its favor. (Rates and availability are not yet available.) But otherwise there is nothing special attached to this location. Marty Moleski has made a suggestion for a theme: "Redeeming Reason: Michael Polanyi's Vision." Phil Rolnick suggested that it might be broader, for the issues encompass our whole civilization. Walt suggested that we invite historian of science (acquainted with Polanyi) Mary Jo Nye as one of the principal speakers. Dale suggested that if the Polanyi Reader is being published, we might use it as a theme. Another possibility is a meeting at Yale in celebration of the Poteat Archives. Esther suggested that we call attention to Polanyi's role as a "Public Intellectual." Phil Rolnick raised the possibility of locating the conference at the University of St. Thomas in St. Paul, with its connections to 4 other seminaries in the area and the resources of the Twin Cities. This would help significantly to promote the Conference to a new audience. And if the Theology Department should co-sponsor it, we might be able to get rooms for free. It was proposed that President David appoint a small committee to explore the possibilities.

14. The Future Disposition of *TAD*, given Phil Mullins' retirement. Four things need to be addressed: (1) set up a "mirror" of the website; (2) set up an alternative financial channel (other than Missouri Western); (3) locate a future editor of *TAD*; (4) make a clear decision about whether in the future to do a print journal in addition to having *TAD* online. David, passing on the recommendation of Holmes Rolston, said that it is important to get an institution that wants to gain recognition through sponsorship of *TAD*. Phil explained that his duties could be divided up as follows: (a) collecting dues/maintaining mailing list; (b) production of the

TAD issues in digital form and general maintenance and expansion of the Polanyi Society web site ; and (c) production of *TAD* issues in printed form. President David urged us to keep all this in the back of our minds. If any of us can think of someone who might possibly serve as editor, that person should pass that information on to Phil and/or David.

15. Polanyi Sessions at the American Philosophical Association Convention(s—for there are 3 conventions per year): Walt is doing something at the Eastern Division APA Convention this December with the “Field Being Group.” Also Stephania Jha is presenting a paper.

16. Wally thanked Phil Mullins for doing much for the Society; at that everyone clapped and we adjourned the meeting.

Respectfully submitted,
Dale Cannon, Secretary

Polanyi Society: Treasurer’s Report 9/01/09-8/31/10

The Scott Fund CD was cashed out at \$ 8,167.66, which includes interest of \$159.30 (2009) and \$282.07 (2010). These dollars were delivered to the new Treasurer, Charles Lowney to be re-invested.

Statement Balance (9/01/09):	4,641.52
Income:	
Membership and contributions:	4,480.00
Total Income:	4,480.00
Expenses:	
<i>TAD</i> (printing)	1,413.10
<i>TAD</i> (supplies)	106.77
<i>TAD</i> (postage)	1,089.81
Total <i>TAD</i> :	2,609.68

Travel Fund:	500.00
Travel Fund:	825.00
Total Travel:	1,325.00
Total Expenses:	3,934.68
Balance at MWSU:	*545.32
Statement Balance (8/31/10)	4,641.52

*MWSU amount may change as dues come in, etc.

Jere Moorman, Treasurer

Donations to the Polanyi Society

In past years, many have generously included with dues payment a US tax deductible contribution to the Society, which is a registered IRS 501C 3 non profit organization. These dollars go to promote things such as the Travel Fund which supported student travel to the October 2010 annual meeting featuring graduate student papers. In this issue (pp. 8-9), is the first announcement about a June 2012 Society-sponsored conference which likely will be in Chicago. Like the last two Chicago conferences, we expect that this conference will strain the spartan Polanyi Society budget (see the annual Treasurer’s report on p.6), since the conference will include some plenary speakers and some scholarships to help support younger scholars. Donors may earmark contributions; those who donate to the support of the upcoming 2012 conference will be listed in the program.

At the recent Polanyi Society Board meeting, a Society endowment fund was established. A Bylaw change describes the objectives and operation of this fund. Generally stated, the long term objective of setting up an endowment is to put the Society’s programs on a sounder financial basis. A future issue of *TAD* will describe the endowment program. Donations to the endowment are welcome.

2012 Polanyi Society Conference

Connections/Disconnections: Polanyi and Contemporary Concerns and Domains of Inquiry

Call For Papers

The Polanyi Society will sponsor a conference in early June of 2012. Negotiations for the exact dates and place are still pending, although, like the 2008 Polanyi Conference, this will likely be a three-day conference at Loyola University, Chicago held the week of June 10, 2012. Conference participants will have the opportunity to spend an afternoon at the Regenstein Library of the University of Chicago reviewing the archival Polanyi materials held there. The conference will include several plenary speakers or panels as well as parallel sessions in which conference participants present and discuss papers with others interested in the session's particular topic. This will be a conference that builds in many opportunities for discussion and, like recent Polanyi Society-sponsored conferences, is open to persons using Polanyi-related ideas in a number of fields.

Proposals are invited for papers that examine the themes of post-critical thought in the context of the new century. The following are some suggested general categories within which specific papers might be grouped. [Please do not think of these categories as a limit for submissions but as a springboard for your own reflections. The final program will reflect groupings adjusted in light of proposals submitted.]

- Polanyi As Public Intellectual: Cultural Criticism and Reorientation in the New Global Order
- Redeeming Reason: Does “Personal Knowledge” Have a Future in a Partisan World?
- Polanyi in the Light of Developments in Psychology (and vice versa)
- Polanyi’s Work in Relation to Current Accounts of Organizations, Institutions and Authority
- Doubt and Commitment in the Postmodern Environment
- Religion and Science: Polanyi and Current Discussions
- History and Philosophy of Science: Polanyi and Current Discussions
- Contemporary Politics and Economics in Polanyian Perspective (and vice versa)
- Polanyi and the Rediscovery of Embodiment
- Language, Learning and Logic—Polanyi and Current Discussions
- Trust, Truth and Conscience: Polanyian Communal Values and Contemporary Culture
- The Good Society: Polanyi and Current Challenges
- Pluralism: Does Polanyi Help Us Address Current Interest in and Problems Associated with Diversity?
- Can Polanyi Speak to a Digital Age?
- Resources in Polanyi for Theological Reconstruction in the Face of Fanaticism and Secularism
- Skills, Practice and Virtue—Polanyian Links
- Polanyi on the Importance of the Beautiful
- Polanyi’s Antireductionism and the Logic of Emergence
- Proposals for panel presentations are invited

Proposals should be 250-300 words and will be reviewed by a panel of jurors. Send an electronic copy of the proposal without your name on it as an attachment to Phil Mullins at mullins@missouriwestern.edu. In the body of the e-mail, provide a preferred mailing address (or fax number) as well a phone number of the author. The initial deadline for receipt of proposals is October 1, 2011. If there is space on the program, those who do not meet the October 1 initial deadline can submit proposals before the final deadline of March 30, 2012. Priority consideration will be given to proposals meeting the October 1 deadline. If the proposal is for a panel, the full panel needs to be identified and one member designated as the primary contact. The panel proposal should outline why a discussion of this topic is important. Future issues of *TAD* and a posting on the Polanyi Society web site (<http://www.missouriwestern.edu/orgs/polanyi/>) will include additional conference information.

2011 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting Call for Papers

The annual meeting for the Polanyi Society for 2011 will be held in San Francisco in conjunction with the American Academy of Religion annual meeting. We are projecting that the AAR will provide two meeting slots, one on the morning of Saturday, November 19, and the second in the evening of the same day.

The overall theme for the meeting is “Persons in Society”. The Saturday morning session will feature a presentation by Professor Darcia Narvaez (a psychologist from Notre Dame who has used Polanyi’s ideas in her research on the nature of persons) with two or three formal responses. This session, may be jointly sponsored with another AAR group, Persons, Culture and Society. Proposals that connect Polanyi’s ideas to current understandings/dimensions of society are invited for the evening session.

Saturday morning session: The Moral Person: Psychology and Neuroscience and Polanyi

Saturday evening session: Open--Papers may address (but are not limited to):

- Polanyi and Ecological Psychology
- Organizations, Institutions and Authority
- Contemporary Politics and Economics
- Truth, Trust, and Conscience: Polanyian Communal Virtues and Contemporary Culture
- The Good Society: A Modest Polanyian Vision
- Polanyi and Pluralism

Proposals (250-300 words) should be sent as an attachment to Paul Lewis (LEWIS_PA@mercer.edu) by April 1, 2011. Inquiries are invited.