

Tradition & Discovery

The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXXV

Number 3
(Completes Volume XXXV)

2008--2009

Preface	2
News and Notes	3
2009 Polanyi Society Meetings.....	6
“The Christian Encounter of Paul Tillich and Michael Polanyi”	7
Richard Gelwick	
Notes on Contributors	20
“Michael and Paulus: A Dynamic Uncoordinated Duo”.....	21
Durwood Foster	
Submissions for Publication.....	39
“Polanyi’s Enduring Gift to ‘Theology and Science’”	40
Robert John Russell	
WWW Polanyi Resources.....	47
“A Response To The Papers of Robert John Russell, Durwood Foster and Richard Gelwick”	48
Donald Musser	
Information on Polanyi Society Electronic Discussion List	50

The Polanyi Society

General Editor-Tradition & Discovery

Phil Mullins
Missouri Western State University
St. Joseph, MO 64507
(816)271-5688 FAX (816)271-5980
mullins@missouriwestern.edu

Walter Mead, Board President

4 Kenyon Court
Bloomington, IL 61701-3320
wbmead@comcast.net

Martin X. Moleski, S.J., Board Secretary

Canisius College
Buffalo, NY 14208
(716)888-2383 FAX (716)886-6506
moleski@canisius.edu

Jere Moorman, Board Treasurer

1020 Partrick Road
Napa, CA 94558
JEREMOOR@aol.com

Dale Cannon

Division of Humanities
Western Oregon University
Monmouth, OR 97361 USA
cannodw@wou.edu

David Rutledge

Department of Religion
Furman University
Greenville, SC 29613-6298
David.Rutledge@furman.edu

Esther Meek

Geneva College
Beaver Falls, PA 15010
longingtoknow@gmail.com

Phil Rolnick

University of St. Thomas
2115 Summit Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55105
PAROLNICK@stthomas.edu

Zhenhua Yu

Department of Philosophy
East China Normal University
3663 North Zhongshan Rd.
Shanghai 200062, China
ecnuy@hotmai.com

Tony Clark

Department of Religion and Humanities
Friends University
2100 W. University St.
Wichita, KS 67213
clarkto@friends.edu

Diane Yeager

Theology Department
Georgetown University
37th and O Streets, NW
Washington, DC 20057
yeagerd@georgetown.edu

Associate Editor/Board of Directors

Paul Lewis
Mercer University
Macon, GA 31207
(478)301-4166
lewis_pa@mercer.edu

Book Review Editor

Walter Gulick
Montana State University--Billings
Billings, MT 59101
(406)657-2904
WGulick@msubillings.edu

Preface

This issue is devoted to the papers originally presented at the 2007 Polanyi Society annual meeting, which focused on the 1963 Berkeley encounter of Michael Polanyi and Paul Tillich. This Society meeting was a joint meeting with the North American Tillich Society. Some readers may recall that in the Polanyi centennial year of 1991 in Kansas City there was a similar meeting with the Tillich Society on the same topic. Two interesting papers by the late Charles McCoy and Richard Gelwick with a response by Donald Musser were eventually published on this session in *TAD* 22:1 (1995-96) which is available in the *TAD* electronic archives on the Polanyi Society web site. Readers may want to look back at these earlier reflections for they are a prelude to this new set of essays on a topic that obviously was not exhausted with the earlier publications. I am delighted that the new essays include one from Durwood Foster who was involved in both the first and second meetings on the 1963 encounter. Foster is a first-rate Tillich scholar, a friend and teacher of several Polanyians, and a figure who recently has reread Polanyi, so he brings new eyes to his thinking about Polanyi and Tillich in his captivating discussion of what he dubs “a dynamic uncoordinated duo.” There is a fresh essay by Gelwick and a new response by Musser. The Foster, Gelwick and Musser essays, like the 1991 papers on Tillich and Polanyi, have also been published in *Bulletin of the North American Paul Tillich Society* (34:3, Summer 2008). Bob Russell, a Foster student and a leader in recent “theology and science” discussions, contributed to the 2007 annual meeting session a short assessment of the lasting impact of Polanyi’s thought on the growing interdisciplinary field of “theology and science.” This too is included in this issue. Be sure that you review “News and Notes” where there is information about the new Poteat archives at Yale and about publications and papers that follow up on earlier *TAD* discussions or inquiries opened at the 2008 Loyola Polanyi Conference. Also you will find (p.6) the program for the November 6 and 7, 2009 session of the upcoming Society annual meeting in Montreal.

Phil Mullins

Tradition and Discovery is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher’s Index* and *Religious and Theological Abstracts* and is included in the EBSCO online database of academic and research journals.

NEWS AND NOTES

Polanyi Society Travel Fund In Need

For students and others requiring assistance to attend the Society's meetings limited funding may be available. Society members are urged to inform worthy candidates that this assistance is available. Those interested in this funding, as well as those who know of potential candidates, should contact **Walter Mead** (wbmead@comcast.net) and see the information on the Polanyi Society web site. Since the 2009 Polanyi Society annual meeting is in Montreal in November, this as an opportunity to attract Canadian graduate students and individuals who have recently finished graduate studies; we hope to have a special roundtable discussion to assist and encourage these people in their Polanyian studies. However, we presently have only sufficient money in our Travel Fund account to provide for one student. Contributions to this Fund in any amount will be gratefully received by Wally Mead, 4 Kenyon Court, Bloomington, IL 61701. They are tax-deductible.

Update On *Appraisal*

An issue of *Appraisal: The Journal of the Society for Post-Critical Philosophy and Personalist Studies* (v. 7, n. 2 [October 2008]) came out in May, 2009 and the March 2008 issue (v. 7, n. 1) was published several months ago. *Appraisal* editor Richard Allen reports that illness has put the journal a bit behind publication schedule, but it should catch up during the summer and fall of 2009. The March 2008 issue included the following essays on Wittgenstein and Polanyi: (1) **Philip Rolnick**, "Wittgenstein and Polanyi on the Person." (2) **Charlie Lowney**, "Seeing, Saying and Being the Gestalt: Continuing Investigations on Wittgenstein and Polanyi on the Concept of the Person." The October 2008 issue included the following articles on Hans Jonas, Eric Voegelin and William

Poteat: (1) **Antonio Casado and Rodriguez-Arias**, "Hans Jonas' Contribution to Bioethics: 40 Years after His 'Philosophical Reflections on Experimenting with Human Subjects.'" (2) **Giorgio Baruchello**, "Gnosis, Sustainable Development and Racism: Hans Jonas as a Political Thinker." (3) **Maben Walter Poirier**, "Eric Voegelin's Immanentism: A Man at Odds with the Transcendent, Pt. I." (4) **David Rutledge**, "William Poteat: The Primacy of the Person."

Appraisal (i.e., The Society for Post-Critical and Personalist Studies) and the John Macmurray Fellowship sponsored a conference on April 18, 2009 in Oxford. The conference theme was "Persons and Agency." The following papers were presented: (1) **Walter Gulick**, "Who Are the Persons of Michael Polanyi's *Personal Knowledge* and John Macmurray's *Persons in Relation*?" (2) **Phil Mullins**, "Polanyi on Agency and Some Links to Macmurray."

Colin Burch is now providing valuable help with editorial work and **Mark Arnold** will take up the post of secretary of The Society for Post-Critical and Personalist Studies in the autumn. **Richard Allen** (rt.allen@ntlworld.com) is inviting volunteers to take on other tasks such as treasurer, webmaster and conference master for *Appraisal*.

The *Appraisal* website at <http://www.spcps.org.uk/> has recently been revamped. You can view the table of contents of all issues going back to volume 1 in March 1996. You can order a CD with all back issues, volumes 1 through 6. Payments can now be made via the website, making things much easier for subscribers outside UK.

Struan Jacobs, one of the writers in the 2006-2007 issue of *TAD* (33:2) focusing on Polanyi and Thomas Kuhn, has recently published another article

on the topic, “Thomas Kuhn’s Memory” *Intellectual History Review* 19 (1) 2009: 83–101. The abstract follows:

Scholars have suggested that Thomas Kuhn’s theory of science in his famous study, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, drew from ideas of Michael Polanyi. There are certain striking resemblances between Polanyi’s masterwork, *Personal Knowledge*, and Kuhn’s, *Scientific Revolutions*, books that were published only a few years apart (1958 and 1962). The present discussion particularly concerns three similarities between Kuhn’s thought and that of Polanyi, making use of hitherto unpublished correspondence between Kuhn and William Poteat, Professor of Christianity and Culture at Duke University. Written early in 1967, the letters (two from Poteat, one from Kuhn) are reproduced in the appendix of this article. Of the similarities, one is between Kuhn’s idea of the ‘paradigm’ as exemplar, with its connotation of unexpressed knowledge, and Polanyi’s theme of ‘tacit knowledge’. Another similarity is between their respective accounts of world pictures (Kuhn’s idea of paradigms as ‘constellations’ and Polanyi’s image of ‘frameworks’). Third is the similarity between Kuhn’s theory of ‘incommensurability’ and Polanyi’s notion of cognitive frameworks as separated by a ‘logical gap’. This article specifies where Kuhn cites, and what he has to say about, Polanyi’s work, and it draws attention to relevant silences, inaccuracies and inconsistencies in Kuhn’s writing. We are aiming at an intensive, accurately detailed discussion of whether Polanyi may have been among Kuhn’s important sources.

Keith Morgan presented at the Academy of Management Annual Meeting, Anaheim, CA, (August 2008) “Creating a Graphical Three (3) Dimensional Diagram of the Knowledge Transfer Process.” The abstract follows (and the paper is available at <http://www.coalescentknowledge.com/papers.htm>):

Polanyi’s tacit and explicit knowledge theory will be integrated with coalescent knowledge theory (a shared knowledge concept) to create a graphical three (3) dimensional diagram of the knowledge

transfer process. This diagram can be used by management consultants to understand and create a customized knowledge transfer process for clients.

Charles Lowney’s article “Authenticity and Reconciliation of Modernity” was published in *The Pluralist* (v. 4, n. 1 [Spring 2009]): 33-50.

Richard Allen’s essay “The Unity of the Person” also appears in *The Pluralist* (v. 4, n. 1 [Spring 2009]): 77-84.

A Note On Polanyi Society Membership

A recent change in subscription procedure may have caused some confusion. There are three issues of *TAD* each year (October, February and July). Self-addressed return envelopes are now enclosed in all printed copies (mailed in the U.S.) of the October and February issues. The subscription cycle begins in the fall of each academic year. Even if you mail in your dues in the October envelope, your February issue will also include an envelope because the US Post Office requires all *TAD* mailing parcels to be identical to qualify for the lowest mailing rate. Rather than use the return envelope, you can, of course, always e-mail subscription information to Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu). When the revision of the Polanyi Society web materials is completed in the summer of 2009, you should be able to complete a subscription form on the web if you prefer.

The Polanyi Society is a very economical academic/professional society. The annual membership is currently \$35 (\$25 for libraries and \$15 for students). The Society has regular expenses associated with producing, printing and mailing *TAD* and with sponsoring academic meetings. Recently, we have added things such as the scholarship/travel fund for younger scholars which also require some resources. The Society much appreciates the contributions which several members have made to support the travel fund as well as regular operating expenses. Annual financial data is normally published in the February issue of

TAD. The Society is an IRS-501(c)3 organization (certified non-profit organization). Any donation members make above the membership rate is tax deductible in the US. You should receive a tax letter for such donations from the Society; if you do not, please inquire.

Although the Polanyi Society is an international organization, it is an increasingly expensive, bureaucratic nightmare to mail printed copies of *TAD* outside the US. In the post-911 world, each non-domestic mailing parcel must have a tracer (paperwork) attached. The Society now produces and archives an identical electronic version of *TAD* available at the same time the printed copy is mailed on the Polanyi Society web site at <<http://www.missouriwestern.edu/orgs/polanyi/>>. Anyone who wishes can easily download all or part of any issue. Society members living outside the US are encouraged to access the electronic *TAD* rather than have a paper copy mailed to them. Those who wish can subscribe to an e-mail list which provides an e-mail notice three times a year (as soon as the electronic *TAD* is posted) with the table of contents of the current issue. Those who receive the electronic edition of *TAD* are encouraged to use e-mail or the Polanyi Society web site to pay annual dues and make contributions to the Society.

Special Collection Of William Poteat Papers

A collection of Poteat's papers is being established at the Yale Divinity School Library. James Clement Van Pelt, a former student of Poteat presently living in New Haven, CT, has worked with Wally Mead, a graduate of YDS, in providing for this archive. We are grateful to Paul Stuehrenberg, YDS Librarian, and Martha Smalley, Special Collections Librarian, for making it possible for us to make the late William Poteat's papers optimally available for future research and thereby not only assuring the continuation of Professor Poteat's legacy but also encouraging the further creative application of Polanyi's insights of the quality and originality represented in Poteat's works. So far four of Bill Poteat's former students and colleagues have contributed their correspondence with Poteat, their notes, and their audio recordings of his lectures and interviews to this archive. There is likely more material out there that could be of great value to future scholars. Those who wish to retain their valued correspondence, etc., in their possession are encouraged to make copies of the relevant material and contact Wally Mead at the e-mail address below. Mead will spend the summer organizing and cataloging the material prior to delivering it to YDS. These materials will hopefully be further ordered and made available to the public sometime during the fall 2009 semester. The Yale Divinity School Library will henceforth hold all literary and other property rights to the unpublished writings in this collection. We are presently considering the possibility of holding a future meeting of the Society in New Haven (perhaps in conjunction with the YDS Initiative in Religion and Science program that Van Pelt coordinates) to celebrate this new research resource and to draw upon some of the relevant regional scholarship. If you have materials that you think would be of value to this Poteat Collection, please inform Wally Mead (wbmead@comcast.net).

2009 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting

Montreal, Quebec.

The Polanyi Society will hold its annual meeting November 6-7, 2009 in conjunction with the AAR annual meeting in Montreal. To attend either or both of the sessions of the the Polanyi Society annual meeting, it is not necessary to register for the AAR meeting. For additional information about the AAR meeting, go to the American Academy of Religion Annual Meeting site: http://www.aarweb.org/meetings/Annual_Meeting/Current_Meeting/default.asp. The hotels and rooms in which the annual meeting will be held will be included in the October 2009 issue of *TAD* and will be posted, when available, with other information about the annual meeting on the Polanyi Society web site (<http://www.missouriwestern.edu/orgs/polanyi/>). Details will also be listed in the AAR annual meeting program.

Friday, 6 November 2009

9:00-11:00pm Panel: "Toward a Polyanian Science of the Virtues"
Walt Gulick, Montana State University, Billings
Paul Lewis, Mercer University
Diane Yeager, Georgetown University

Saturday, 7 November 2009

8:00to9:00 am A Celebration of *The Tacit Dimension* Re-Publication
Light breakfast

Reflections on *The Tacit Dimension*
Phil Mullins, Missouri Western State University
Wally Mead, Illinois State University

9:15to 10:10 am "Of One Mind? Merleau-Ponty and Polanyi on the Reduction of Mind to Body"
Florentien Verhage and Charles Lowney, Washington and Lee University
Response: David Rutledge, Furman University

10:20to11:15 am "Is the Pope Catholic? Polyanian Reflections on Continuity and Authority"
John Apczynski, St. Bonaventure University
Response: Joe Kroger, St. Michael's College

11:15to11:30am Business Meeting