

Tradition & Discovery

The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXXIII

Number 2

2006--2007

Preface.....	2
News and Notes.....	3
Information on Polanyi Society Electronic Discussion List	3
Minutes of Polanyi Society Annual Meeting of November 18, 2006.....	5
2007 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting Call for Papers	7
“Polanyi vs. Kuhn: Worldviews Apart”.....	8
Martin X. Moleski, SJ	
“Michael Polanyi and Thomas Kuhn: Priority and Credit”.....	25
Struan Jacobs	
WWW Polanyi Resources.....	36
“Public Recognition, Vanity, and the Quest for Truth: Reflection on ‘Polanyi vs. Kuhn’”..	37
Aaron Milavec	
Notes on Contributors.....	48
“Darwin, Kuhn, and Polanyi: A Comment on ‘Polanyi vs. Kuhn: Worlds Apart’”	49
Richard Henry Schmitt	
“The Polanyi - Kuhn Issue”.....	56
Maben W. Poirier	
Submissions for Publication.....	65
Reviews.....	66
Joel R. Primack and Nancy Ellen Abrams, <i>The View from the Center of the Universe</i>	
Reviewed by Walter Gulick	
Francisco J. Ayala, <i>Darwin and Intelligent Design</i>	
Reviewed by Paul Lewis	
Brian D. McLaren, <i>A Generous Orthodoxy</i> .	
Reviewed by Paul Lewis	
Polanyi Society Membership.....	71

The Polanyi Society

General Editor-*Tradition & Discovery*

Phil Mullins
Missouri Western State University
St. Joseph, MO 64507
(816)271-4386 FAX (816)271-5987
mullins@missouriwestern.edu

Walter Mead, Board President

4 Kenyon Court
Bloomington, IL 61701-3320
wbmead@ilstu.edu

Martin X. Moleski, S.J., Board Secretary

Canisius College
Buffalo, NY 14208
(716)888-2383 FAX (716)886-6506
moleski@canisius.edu

Jere Moorman, Board Treasurer

1020 Partrick Road
Napa, CA 94558
JEREMOOR@aol.com

Dale Cannon

Division of Humanities
Western Oregon University
Monmouth, OR 97361 USA
cannodw@wou.edu

Richard Gelwick

12 Prosser Rd.
Harpwell, ME 04079
rprogel@juno.com

C. P. Goodman

Alpines, 2 Cliffe Lane/ Hathersage
Hope Valley, Derbyshire S32 1DE UK
cpgoodman@lineone.net

Esther Meek

Geneva College
Beaver Falls, PA 15010
longingtoknow@earthlink.net

Richard W. Moody

Gannon University
109 University Square
Erie, PA 16541
moodey001@gannon.edu

YU Zhenhua

Department of Philosophy
East China Normal University
3663 North Zhongshan Rd.
Shanghai 200062, China
ecnuyu@hotmail.com

Tony Clark

Department of Religion and Humanities
Friends University
2100 W. University St.
Wichita, KS 67213
clarkto@friends.edu

Associate Editor/Board of Directors

Paul Lewis
Mercer University
Macon, GA 31207
(478) 301-4166
lewis_pa@mercer.edu

Book Review Editor

Walter Gulick
Montana State University--Billings
Billings, MT 59101
(406)657-2904/
WGulick@msubillings.edu

Preface

This is a special issue of *TAD* devoted to discussion of the work of Polanyi and its connection (and disconnection) with the work of Thomas Kuhn. Those who have followed this journal over the years know that this topic has popped up again and again. Marty Moleski, the surviving Polanyi biographer, wrote the lead article (“Polanyi vs. Kuhn: Worldviews Apart”) and, after discussion with others, I invited Struan Jacobs, Aaron Milavec, Dick Schmitt, and Maben Poirier to comment on Moleski’s article and the general topic of Polanyi and Kuhn. All of the commentators have long pondered--and most have published essays here or elsewhere treating--the topic.

Let me add only one interesting historical note that readers might want to factor into the rich discussion in this issue, a note that I gleaned in a recent phone conversation with Richard Gelwick (1/14/07): Thomas Kuhn was on the faculty at the University of California, Berkeley, when Michael Polanyi gave the McEnerney Lectures there in February, 1962. It is possible that he attended these lectures. At the least, Gelwick reports that in either later 1963 or early 1964 he had a most interesting lunch with Kuhn to talk about Polanyi’s ideas. It was a lunch that extended to four hours.

Please pay special attention to some of the material in the first pages of this issue. You will find there minutes of the last official meeting of the Polanyi Society, the financial report, as well as the call for papers for the 2007 annual meeting. Also notice in “News and Notes” that there is included the first notice of two major Polanyi conferences, one at Loyola University in Chicago and the other in Hungary at the Budapest University of Technology and Economics. There will be additional information about these important upcoming 2008 events.

Phil Mullins

Tradition and Discovery is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher’s Index* and *Religious and Theological Abstracts* and is included in the EBSCO online database of academic and research journals.

NEWS AND NOTES

“Personal Knowledge at Fifty”: 2008 Polanyi Society Conference

Mark your calendar now to reserve June 13-15, 2008 for participation in a Polanyi Society sponsored conference at Loyola University, Chicago. *Personal Knowledge* was published in May, 1958 and this conference will celebrate this event and provide an opportunity to reappraise Michael Polanyi’s *magnum opus* and its philosophical agenda in terms of developments in philosophy, science and the globalization of culture. A call for papers will be posted on the Polanyi Society web site in the spring of 2007 and will be included in the next issue of *TAD* (33:3 in July, 2007). The conference will be modeled on the 1991 and 2001 Polanyi Society conferences at Kent State University and Loyola, Chicago. There will be a few plenary speakers as well as parallel sessions in which conference participants present and discuss papers with others interested in the session’s particular topic. This will be a conference that builds in many opportunities for discussion as well as a trip for those interested to the archival Polanyi Papers at the Regenstein Library of the University of Chicago.

Marty Moleski, S.J. (moleski@canisus.edu) and Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu) are co-chairs designated by the Polanyi Society Board of Directors to organize this conference. Please send any suggestions for the conference to Moleski and/or Mullins. Although this event at Loyola should be a modestly priced academic conference, it is clear that the Polanyi Society will need to raise some dollars to support some conference elements. It is also important to attract to this conference some younger scholars with interest in Polanyi. Particularly if you have ideas about sources of support and ways to attract younger scholars, send these along to Moleski and Mullins.

“Reconsidering Polanyi”: 2008 Conference of the Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association

The Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association and the Department of Philosophy and History of Science at the Budapest University of Technology and Economics are sponsoring a conference in Budapest that will be held June 26-28, 2008. The conference has the title “Reconsidering Polanyi” and will provide an opportunity for scholars to discuss Polanyi’s ideas from many different perspectives. The call for papers for this international conference will be included in the July, 2007 issue of *TAD*. Proposals/abstracts will be due by September, 2007. The conference registration is 30 EUR. Accommodations for conference participants will be available both on campus at the Budapest University of Technology and Economics and in nearby hotels. Benedek Láng (conference@filozofia.bme.hu), a member of the conference planning committee, can provide additional information about the conference if you need that before the publication of the call for papers.

Electronic Discussion List

The Polanyi Society supports an electronic discussion group that explores implications of the thought of Michael Polanyi. Anyone interested can join. To join yourself, go to the following address: http://groups.yahoo.com/group/polanyi_list/join. If you have difficulty, send an e-mail to Doug Masini (masini@etsu.edu) and someone will see that you are added to the list.

**Upcoming *Appraisal* Conference
 “Macmurray and Polanyi:
 Two Personalist Philosophers”**

The annual SPCPS (*Appraisal*) conference scheduled for March 30 & 31 at Nottingham has been cancelled. However SPCPS is sponsoring a one-day conference jointly with the John Macmurray Fellowship under the title, “Macmurray and Polanyi: Two Personalist Philosophers”, on Saturday, March 3rd (10.30-4.30) at the Friends’ Meeting House, St Giles, Oxford. For information contact Richard Allen at rt.allen@ntlworld.com.

Patrick Novak presented a paper titled “A Polyanian Understanding of the Colossian Parenesis” in the “Disputed Paulines” section of the Society of Biblical Literature annual meeting in Washington D. C. in November, 2006. His paper argued that Polanyi’s epistemology provides a key in understanding Paul’s intent to form disciples through the Colossian parenesis. Most work in Biblical Studies, character ethics, and theology have examined the what of parenetical material; this paper attempts to show the how. Novak reports that though a few in the audience were acquainted with Polanyi’s name, few if any had an understanding of his epistemology and how it might be related to the discussion of biblical material.

Struan Jacobs, “T. S. Eliot and Michael Polanyi on Tradition in Literature and Science,” *The Dalhousie Review*, 86:3 (Autumn 2006): 373-388.
 Abstract: T. S. Eliot and Michael Polanyi produced important and influential theories of tradition in their respective fields of literature and science. This article describes their theories with particular reference to the concept of order, each man viewing tradition as an indispensable condition of order in modern culture. Similarities between the two theories of tradition are noted.

**Polanyi Society Financial Statement
 September 1, 2005 – August 31, 2006**

Beginning Bal. Checking	\$1685.25
Income	
Membership dues, gifts	\$3100.00
Expenses	
Annual meeting	\$ 200.00
TAD (31, #3+32, #1)	-\$1417.55
TAD (32, #2)	\$ 998.96
Annual meeting	\$ 145.00
Total expenses	\$2761.51
Year End Checking	\$2023.74
<hr/>	
Beginning Bal. Savings	\$2394.33
Income	
Interest	\$ 18.11
Gift (for travel)	\$300.00
Expenses	-0-
Year End Savings	\$2712.44

John V. Apczynski,
 Treasurer

Minutes of Polanyi Society Annual Meeting of November 18, 2006

1. The meeting was called to order at 11:25 AM by President Walt Gulick.

2. The slate of nominees proposed by the Board were elected unanimously:

Wally Mead as President

Marty Moleski renominated to the Board and continuing as Secretary

Jere Moorman as Treasurer

Esther Meek renominated to the Board

Tony Clark nominated as member of the Board

Dick Moody nominated as member of the Board

Zhenhua Yu nominated as member of the Board

Paul Lewis continuing as Vice-President

3. Gulick expressed thanks to those leaving and to those joining the Board.

4. The floor was opened to discussion of topics for next year's Annual Meeting in San Diego:

— Invite Bill Coulson to participate; he is a longtime leader of a Polanyi study group in San Diego, co-author of *Man and the Science of Man* with Carl Rogers, and co-editor of the Studies of the Person textbook series with Rogers.

— Polanyi and Missiology

— Invite Durwood Foster to discuss the connection between Tillich and Polanyi, emphasizing Tillich's article which he suggested to Polanyi as especially helpful, "Participation and Knowledge and Consultation: Problems of an Ontology of Cognition."

--Research being done on Polanyi by those receiving Travel Fellowship to attend the Annual Meeting.

5. The question was raised about having more sessions and/or a different schedule for next year.

— Dinner at the hotel, then the open Polanyi Society meeting? A "box lunch" for dinner—simple, inexpensive, adequate, unobtrusive?

— How best to arrange the time for the board meeting? It has been before the Friday session the last few years, but this causes problems with timing. Perhaps meal times should be protected for convivial discussion, not business. Meals are also an important time to get to know young scholars. Perhaps the board could meet at 6:00 PM, with a light meal or "box lunch" afterward.

— Saturday and Sunday morning meetings instead of Friday night and Saturday morning?

— An additional meeting on Friday afternoon?

6. The question was raised as to whether dues should be increased and perhaps should include a rate for retired persons and a listing of those individuals who contribute more than the regular rate. The Board will work on and refine a new dues schedule.

7. Mead reported on his efforts to have *The Tacit Dimension* reprinted by Eerdman's or Wipf and Stock.

8. Mullins reported there is now available on the Polanyi Society web site a downloadable audio file of the 1966 Polanyi-Rogers dialog. There is also a text file of this dialog posted on the site.

9. Downloadable copies of current issues of *TAD* are posted at the same time the paper editions are published. Mullins reported that there are currently about 50 persons across the world who receive e-mail notification when a new electronic version of *TAD* has been posted. Members are invited to send e-mail addresses to Mullins of anyone who might be interested in receiving notice about the posting of a new *TAD* issue. Mullins suggested that eventually the Society may, for economic reasons, consider publishing only a web version of *TAD*.

10. It was suggested that the responses to papers presented at the Annual Meeting continue to be posted on the electronic discussion list.

11. Dale Cannon reported that there are six members working on a Polanyi Reader. It may be ready for publication by the spring of 2007.

12. Wally Mead expressed appreciation to Leila Kees for housing and transporting several Society members and recipients of the Travel Fund, and urged the Board to thank her officially.

13. The job of managing the Travel Fund will continue to be handled by Wally Mead. He will set up a separate account to deposit funds and disburse them.

14. Ann Herbert Scott's generous donation of \$7513.68 to create a fund in honor of her late husband, William Taussig Scott, was noted with gratitude. Richard Gelwick and Phil Mullins in consultation with her and the Board are to develop criteria for using this donation.

15. Work on a Templeton grant is in limbo until such time that the Polanyi Reader might be available for use.

16. In his farewell Presidential remarks, Walt Gulick noted his gratitude to the financial angels who have supported the Society in recent years, especially Jere Moorman and Wally Mead, and thanked David Rutledge for all of his support during the years that Gulick acted as President of the Society.

Respectfully submitted,

Martin X. Moleski, SJ

2007 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting

Call for Papers

San Diego will be the site for this year's annual meeting of the Polanyi Society. As usual, we will have sessions on Friday and Saturday, November 17 and 18, but our format will be somewhat different this year. The Polanyi Society is now an official "Related Scholarly Organization" of the American Academy of Religion, and our sessions will be listed as part of the regular program of the AAR in addition to being separately listed. This year we are planning to have an additional meeting on Friday afternoon, and we anticipate that the AAR will grant us space as they always have.

The first session is planned for Friday afternoon from 3:00 to 5:00 and will focus on Polanyi's understanding of the person. The thematic paper for this session will be presented by William Coulson and is entitled "On Having Misread Polanyi's Theory of Personal Knowledge." Coulson is the co-editor with Carl Rogers of *Man and the Science of Man*, (1968) which features two papers by Polanyi plus contributions from Rogers, Jacob Bronowski and others. The dialogue between Rogers and Polanyi from this book is now available on the Polanyi Society web site as both a downloadable audio file and a text file. We are seeking to co-sponsor this session with the Person, Culture, and Religion Group. The call is for respondents to Coulson's paper who may also wish to offer constructive work in a Polanyian theory of the person. Presumably if the Person, Culture, and Religion Group agrees to co-sponsor the session, they would provide one respondent and the Polanyi Society the other; if the session is not jointly sponsored, there may be more than one formal response from a Polanyi Society member..

A second session will be offered Friday night. Paper proposals are solicited for this session on any topic relevant to the ongoing work of the Polanyi Society. Special interest has been expressed for work dealing with a Polanyian perspective on cognitive neuropsychology, and this would presumably complement Coulson's emphasis on humanistic psychology.

Our session from 9:00 to 11:30 Saturday morning will feature theologian Durwood Foster's reflections on Paul Tillich's little known 1955 paper entitled "Participation and Knowledge and Cognition: Problems of an Ontology of Cognition." In their dialog in 1963, Tillich suggested to Polanyi that he might find much that is useful in this paper. The paper will soon be available on the Polanyi Society web site. We have offered to co-sponsor this session with the North American Tillich Society. Again, we will need either one or two respondents depending whether the NATS accepts our offer. As soon as information is available about whether one or two of this year's annual meeting session will be co-sponsored it will be posted on the Polanyi Society web site.

Review of proposals will begin Monday, April 2, but early submissions are appreciated. Proposals for serving as a respondent should not only briefly indicate the relevant background and interests that qualify the individual to respond, but also describe any constructive interests that the respondent might hope to develop. Proposals dealing with cognitive neuropsychology or other topics for the second session should ideally be 300 to 500 words long, but full-length papers are also welcomed. Send proposals to Walter Gulick, wgulick@msubillings.edu (phone 406 657-2904).